

Rubric for Peer Evaluation of Assign. #11 Submitted by _____

	Developing 2	Accomplished 3	Exemplary 4	Score
Rebuttal Letter: Format (x0.5)	Cover letter contains at least 4 of 5 sections (letterhead, editor address, date, proper RE file, body) and addresses most comments (>80%) by each reviewer.	Cover letter contains all required sections and addresses almost all comments (>90%) by all reviewers in compartmentalized sequence.	Cover letter contains all required sections and addresses all comments by all reviewers in well-compartmentalized sequence.	/2
Rebuttal Letter: Content	Authors <u>recognized</u> some (<75%) of the major criticisms, they responded to parts of the critics, and the justifications provided appear <u>reasonable</u> .	Authors <u>recognized</u> major criticisms, they responded in somewhat <u>reasonable</u> fashion, but only some justifications provided are <u>convincing</u> .	Authors <u>clearly recognized</u> major criticisms, they responded in <u>reasonable</u> fashion, and the justifications provided are <u>compelling</u> .	/4
Revision: Format (x0.5)	It appears that the cover letter does not list all specific changes made and/or many of the changes (>30%) were not explained sufficiently.	The cover letter outlines clearly (by line item) what specific changes were made and explains in most cases (>85%) why these changes were made.	The cover letter outlines very clearly (by line item) what specific changes were made and why these changes were made.	/2
Revision: Content	Considering the responses by the authors, I am <u>mostly satisfied</u> with the changes made during revision.	Considering the responses by the authors, I am <u>satisfied</u> with the changes made during revision.	Considering the responses by the authors, I am <u>entirely satisfied</u> with the changes made during revision.	/4
Abstract & Graph. Abstr.	Abstract and Graphical Abstract are present.	Abstract is present but not as concise as should/could be. Graphical Abstract carries the main message.	Abstract is brief and concise. Graphical Abstract carries the main message and it is exciting and "impressive".	/4
Overall Judgment	The revised paper is <u>good</u> .	The revised paper is <u>very good</u> (top 25%).	The revised paper is <u>excellent</u> (top 10%).	/4
			Total (Max. 20)	

Comments regarding perceived strengths/weaknesses of the revision: